

**Studi di diritto dell'Unione europea**

*diretta da*

A. Adinolfi, M. Condinanzi, P. Manzini, R. Mastroianni e F. Munari

Mario Barbano

# **EU State aid law as applied to the airline industry**

Pandemic crisis and long-term perspectives



**Giappichelli**

## Table of Contents

	<i>pag.</i>
Foreword	XI
Executive Summary	XIII
List of abbreviations	XXI
List of tables and figures	XXIII
Introduction	1
Research questions, structure and methodology	5

### **Part I** **The aviation market** **and its current regulatory framework**

1. The principle of State sovereignty over the airspace and its impact on civil aviation economic governance	8
2. The EU internal aviation market	15
2.1. The scope of the ‘special provision’ of Article 100(2) TFEU	15
2.2. Early legislative initiatives prior to liberalization	17
2.3. The ‘liberalization packages’	19
2.4. From Open Skies rulings to ‘comprehensive’ agreements	22
2.5. The outcomes of liberalization: new business models and market concentration	24
3. Efforts on the way to achieve sustainable aviation	27
3.1. Climate change and the need to rethink air transport	27
3.2. Overview of the relevant international and EU environmental law	29
3.3. The regime applicable to civil aviation	34
4. Concluding remarks	38

## **Part II**

### **EU State aid law**

1.	General principles and main procedural rules	41
2.	The definition of aid under Article 107(1) TFEU	47
	2.1. State resources	49
	2.2. Economic advantage	50
	2.3. Selectivity	53
	2.4. Distortion to competition	54
	2.5. Effect on trade	57
3.	Relevant exemptions in Articles 107, paras 2-3 TFEU	57
	3.1. Introductory remarks	57
	3.2. Aid de jure compatible with the internal market under Article 107(2) TFEU	59
	3.2.1. Damage compensation schemes in the aviation market	62
	3.3. Discretionary exceptions under Article 107(3) TFEU	64
	3.3.1. Aid remedying to a serious disturbance in the economy of the Member State	66
	3.3.2. Aid facilitating the development of certain economic activities. Sectoral aid to the aviation industry	68
	3.3.3. Rescuing and restructuring aid	71
	3.3.4. Environmental aid	73
4.	The external dimension of the level playing field: the attempt to counter-act third countries' subsidies	78
5.	Concluding remarks	80

## **Part III**

### **State aid and market shocks: public support to airlines during the pandemic crisis**

1.	COVID-19: a different kind of crisis	84
2.	Member States' financial support to the aviation industry during the pandemic	91
3.	The choice of the legal basis	94
	3.1. Damage compensation under Article 107(2)(b) TFEU	94
	3.2. Remedy to a serious disturbance under Article 107(3)(b) TFEU as interpreted under the Temporary Framework	96
	3.3. Aid approved under Article 107(3)(c) TFEU and Rescue and restructuring guidelines	101
4.	The Commission's practice and CJEU's case-law: selected topics	101
	4.1. The definition of eligibility criteria in aid schemes	102

	<i>pag.</i>
4.1.1. The Swedish scheme	103
4.1.2. The French scheme	105
4.1.3. The AG Pitruzzella's opinion and the CJEU's ruling on the Swedish scheme	107
4.2. Comparisons and remarks on eligibility criteria	109
4.2.1. Difference in treatment and objective justifications	109
4.2.2. Weighing the positive and negative effects of the aid	111
4.2.3. Comparison with 'all airlines' schemes	115
4.2.4. Compliance with other EU law provisions: the Italian scheme case	117
4.3. The relationship between individual aid and their legal basis	121
4.3.1. The SAS (damage compensation) cases	121
4.3.2. Concurrent application of Article 107(2)(b) and Article 107(3)(b) TFEU	122
4.3.3. Aid schemes vs individual aid	124
4.3.4. The aid's objective and the alleged redundancy of considerations on 'air connectivity'	125
4.4. Airline group structure and aid received from more than one Member State	127
4.4.1. The KLM I ruling	127
4.4.2. The ruling on TAP SGPS rescue	130
4.4.3. The outcome of the annulment: the new Commission's decisions	132
4.4.4. Pandemic aid to airlines already in difficulty	134
4.4.5. Intra-group dynamics and cumulation of aid	136
4.5. Public support and market dominance	137
4.5.1. The Deutsche Lufthansa case	137
4.5.2. Eligibility for the aid, intensity and State exit	139
4.5.3. Assessing Significant Market Power	140
4.5.4. The adequacy of structural commitments	142
4.5.5. Comparisons with other public capital injections in favour of airlines affected by the pandemic	143
5. State aid and environmental commitments: the case of 'green conditionality' in airline bailouts	145
6. Concluding remarks	149

## Conclusions

### **Future horizons of State aid control: lessons learned from the case study of aviation industry**

1. The pandemic case-law in a wider frame: possible implications for the evolution of State aid law	153
---	-----

	<i>pag.</i>
2. Adding the environmental perspective to State aid control	158
3. Proposals for a more effective State aid control in times of crisis in view of a future EU industrial policy	162

## **Appendix**

A. International Acts	165
i. Treaties and ICJ Judgements	165
ii. ICAO Assembly Resolutions	167
B. Legislation of the European Union	167
C. Jurisprudence of the Court of Justice of the European Union	172
i. Court of Justice	172
ii. Advocate General opinions before the CJEU	175
iii. General Court	175
D. European Commission	178
i. Communications, guidance documents, reports	178
ii. State aid decisions (pre-pandemic)	182
iii. State aid decisions (post-pandemic)	184
iv. Decisions adopted during the pandemic in the aviation sector	185
(1) Individual aid to airlines	185
(2) Aid schemes to airlines	188
(3) Aid to airports and other industry operators	190
E. Bibliography	192
i. Books, collective works, articles	192
ii. Reports and policy briefs	204
iii. Scientific blogs, press releases, newspaper articles	207
iv. Legislation and jurisprudence from other jurisdictions	209